

Instructions for Rubric Use

The BranchED Equity Rubric for OER is designed to be used by educator preparation (EPP) faculty. It is organized around four broad dimensions of equity: Learner-Centered, Critical, Culturally Sustaining, and Universally Designed for Learning (UDL) which are color-coded within the document.

These four equity dimensions are broken down further into criteria, which are then measured through leveled indicators. The indicators are described using vocabulary specific to equity in education, the definitions of which are important to making a reliable and consistent assessment. For this reason, there is a linked glossary in Appendix A which includes the definitions to be used for the purpose of applying the rubric. The rubric measures four levels of evidence for each criterion ranging from Not Observed (0) to High (3).¹ Additionally, “look fors” offer examples of specific evidence to support the identification of each indicator. Screen tips for all look fors and glossary definitions may be accessed by hovering over their respective links in the rubric. Clicking on each link will take the user to the item in the full list of look fors or the glossary.

After the criteria are evaluated for a dimension, an earned score (out of a total possible score) can be calculated and recorded for that dimension. Upon completion of this process for the fourth equity dimension, the user can add the four earned dimension-level scores to obtain an overall equity score for the resource.

We recommend that users take sufficient time to familiarize themselves with the rubric before employing it to evaluate resources. While an individual user can apply the rubric to the resources, we advocate that more than one rater from the same institution evaluate selected resources, obtain individual scores, confer to achieve consensus scores and then calculate the inter-rater reliability using Krippendorff’s alpha or another suitable measure of reliability for ordinal data, such as intra-class correlations (ICCs), Gwet’s AC2, or the Kendall rank correlation coefficient (also known as Kendall’s τ coefficient).² More information about calculating Krippendorff’s alpha can be found here:

<https://www.statisticshowto.com/krippendorffs-alpha/>.

¹ These levels of evidence correspond to traditional rubric performance levels in order to maintain the integrity of the rubric as a “pro asset-based” evaluative instrument.

² Cohen’s kappa and its extension for more than two raters, Fleiss’s kappa, are designed for nominal (categorical) data, and therefore would not be appropriate for the ordinal data generated through the use of this rubric unless their weighted variants are used.

BranchED Equity Rubric for OER

Dimensions of Equity-Oriented Resources	Not observed (0)	Low (1)	Medium (2)	High (3)	Score
LEARNER-CENTERED					
A learner-centered resource addresses:					
Access	Not observed	Provides one way/ opportunity for learners to access content	Provides more than one way for learners to access content [Look fors]	Provides multimodal access to the content	
Identities	Not observed	Makes tenuous connections to learners' identities or lived experiences	Makes clear connections to learners' identities and lived experiences [Look fors]	Makes clear connections to learners' intersectional identities and lived experiences	
Funds of knowledge	Not observed	Makes mention of but does not build upon learners' funds of knowledge	Builds upon learners' funds of knowledge [Look fors]	Leverages learners' funds of knowledge	
Interests	Not observed	Makes attempts to connect to learner interests, but the interests may really be defined by teacher	Connects to learner interests by allowing choices [Look fors]	Meaningfully and authentically connects to learner interests and provides ways for learners to direct their own learning	
Voices	Not observed	Provides minimal opportunities for students' own voices to be included	Provides opportunities for students' own voices to be included [Look fors]	Invites students to be co-creators of the learning experience and have decision-making power OR students' thoughts, attitudes, and actual work is incorporated into the resource in visible ways	
Value	Not observed	Offers activities/ assignments that have minimal value beyond school (Wiley's "renewable assignments")	Offers activities/ assignments that have value beyond school (Wiley's "renewable assignments") [Look fors]	Actively incorporates activities/assignments that have value beyond school (Wiley's "renewable assignments"). May involve "publishing" learners' work for a broader audience than the teacher/classmates	

Dimensions of Equity-Oriented Resources	Not observed (0)	Low (1)	Medium (2)	High (3)	Score
Personalization	Not observed	Acknowledges one aspect of personalized learning(interests, profiles, styles, or readiness)	Incorporates more than one aspect of personalized learning (interests, profiles, styles, and readiness) [Look fors]	Encompasses all or most aspects of personalized learning (interests, profiles, styles, and readiness)	
Meaning construction	Not observed	Activates learners' ability to create meaning from content	Facilitates learners' ability to create meaning from content (constructivism theory) [Look fors]	Facilitates and promotes learners' ability to create meaning from content (constructivism theory)	
Agency	Not observed	Encourages personal challenge and responsibility for learning process	Enables personal challenge and responsibility for learning process [Look fors]	Empowers personal challenge, motivation, and agency that facilitates the learning process	
				Learner-Centered Subscore:	

CRITICAL

A critical resource addresses:

Perspective	Not observed	Acknowledges diverse perspectives within instructional material	Represents or provides diverse perspectives within instructional material [Look fors]	Challenges perspectives within instructional materials	
Equity & Inclusion	Not observed	Attempts to address issues of equity and inclusion but uses framing or baseline of a "dominant culture."	Addresses issues of equity and inclusion, as well as barriers to diversity, equity, and inclusion [Look fors]	Implements measures to resolve issues of equity and inclusion and eliminates barriers to diversity, equity, and inclusion	
Narratives	Not observed	Acknowledges extraordinary individuals from marginalized groups	Recognizes strengths of each individual from marginalized groups [Look fors]	Utilizes asset-based narratives	

Dimensions of Equity-Oriented Resources	Not observed (0)	Low (1)	Medium (2)	High (3)	Score
Empathy	Not observed	Recognizes importance of empathy	Promotes empathy OR models empathetic thinking [Look fors]	Creates space for learners' empathetic interactions and practices	
Divergence	Not observed	Demonstrates some resistance to stereotypes but to limited effect	Resists stereotypes, as well as promotion and reproduction of a dominant culture [Look fors]	Empowers divergent thinking and methods of making meaning of the content	
				Critical Subscore:	

CULTURALLY SUSTAINING

A culturally sustaining resource addresses:

Pluralism	Not observed	Acknowledges non-dominant cultures or contexts	Draws from a variety of cultures, contexts, and groups (BranchED's Equity-Oriented Resource Criteria) [Look Fors]	Perpetuates and fosters linguistic, literate, and cultural pluralism for positive social transformation and revitalization (Paris and Alim, 2017)	
Intersectionality	Not observed	Is inclusive of race, ethnicity, language, gender, age, ability, socioeconomic status, etc. (BranchED's Equity-Oriented Resource Criteria)	Is responsive to intersectional identities [Look fors]	Re-centers educational practices around the languages, literacies, and cultural traditions that students bring into classrooms (Paris & Alim, 2017)	
Counter-hegemony	Not observed	Is free of bias (BranchED's Equity-Oriented Resource Criteria)	Openly acknowledging bias (BranchED's Equity-Oriented Resource Criteria) [Look fors]	Challenges the hegemonic "white gaze" through which academic performance has been historically legitimized	
Sustainment	Not observed	Provides learners the opportunity to share their own culture and cultural heritage (Weintrop et al., 2019)	Encourages learners to share their own culture and cultural heritage [Look fors]	Leverages opportunities for learners to celebrate their own cultures and cultural heritages, as well as the culture and cultural heritage of peers	

Dimensions of Equity-Oriented Resources	Not observed (0)	Low (1)	Medium (2)	High (3)	Score
Connections	Not observed	Makes connections to learners' homes and communities (Weintrop et al., 2019)	Incorporates and builds on learners' home and community experiences (reality pedagogy) [Look fors]	Critically centers around learners' home and community experiences	
				Culturally Sustaining Subscore:	

UNIVERSALLY DESIGNED FOR LEARNING

A universally designed resource addresses:

Re-presentation	Not observed	Provides access to options for perception, including offering ways of customizing display of information, alternatives to auditory and visual information	Builds upon options for clarifying language, symbols, syntax and structure [Look fors]	Activates internalization with options for comprehension through the supplying of background knowledge, highlighting of patterns, and relationships	
Action & Expression	Not observed	Provides access to options for flexibility with timing and access to assistive technology. [Provides flexibility with timing and access to assistive technology.]	Builds upon options for expression & communication through multiple media and multiple tools [Look fors]	Activates internalization options for guiding appropriate goal-setting, strategy development, and monitoring progress	
Engagement	Not observed	Provides access to options for recruiting interest by optimizing individual choice and autonomy, relevance, value, authenticity, and minimizing threats and distractions	Builds upon options for highlighting goals and objectives with varying demands, resources, and mastery-oriented feedback [Look fors]	Activates internalization options for self-regulation by promoting expectations and beliefs that optimize motivation, personal coping skills self-assessment and reflection	
				UDL Subscore:	
				TOTAL EQUITY SCORE	

Look Fors

Dimensions of <u>Equity</u> -Oriented Resources	Look fors
LEARNER-CENTERED	
Access	Materials that can be accessed on multiple devices; materials that can be saved or printed, as well as used in digital formats
Identities	Project-based learning that provides opportunities for learners to see themselves in the projects (Weintrop)
Funds of knowledge	Intentional opportunities for collaboration which recognizes value in all participants' contributions; activation of prior knowledge, e.g., preassessment questions
Interests	Learner choice
Voices	Use of learners' experiences as content; reflection questions; elicitation and concrete incorporation of learners' thoughts and attitudes
Value	Assignments that allow students to clearly incorporate their cultures; student-created study guides; products that can be used repeatedly that are relevant to learners' future career goals
Personalization	Materials that respond to specific user input
Meaning construction	Allowing students to reflect and construct their own methods to problem-solving; inviting learners' personal interpretations
Agency	Action-oriented activities; "Examples of learner-centered assessment strategies include reflections, portfolios, Personal Action Plans, and Gedanken Experiments" (Schmidt, Hu, & Bachrach, 2008, p. 293).
CRITICAL	
Perspective	Identification of an assets-based versus deficit narrative in a textbook passage
Equity & Inclusion	Explicit statements about equity or inclusion or threats to such
Narratives	Storytelling that elevates marginalized groups

Dimensions of Equity-Oriented Resources	Look for
Empathy	Use of “I” statements to avoid blame; active listening to what learners are sharing; validating the feelings of others; setting aside personal reactions to allow for the reactions of others
Divergence	Explaining that stereotypes such as “all tall people play basketball” can be hurtful

CULTURALLY SUSTAINING	
Pluralism	Content from a scholar or experienced professional of color or representing the plurality of thought on contemporary educational pedagogy and practice
Intersectionality	Content related to the crossover points of human identities, particularly identities that are marginalized
Counter-hegemony	Content combining knowledge about learning, learners, families, and communities with the ability to see information, ideas, and details from the perspectives of others
Sustainment	Products featuring learners' cultures; narratives of celebration and joy
Connections	Content that allows students to include their daily home and community experiences as part of the learning process

UNIVERSALLY DESIGNED FOR LEARNING	
Representation	Options for engaging with texts, such as text-to-speech, audiobooks, or partner reading; clarifies vocabulary and symbols; support for decoding of text, mathematical notation, and/or symbols; illustrates through multiple media
Action & Expression	Options to express and communicate through a variety of formats, such as with a graphic organizer, or a poster presentation; uses multiple media for communication, including assistive technology such as speech-to-text and text-to-speech
Engagement	Incorporation of findings from surveys of interests, strengths, and needs; clear statements of relevant goals and objectives; guides and checklists for scaffolding goal-setting; prompts and scaffolds to estimate effort, resources, and difficulty; use of activities that include a means by which learners get feedback and have access to alternative scaffolds (e.g., charts, templates, feedback displays) that support a learner's understanding of progress in an accessible and timely manner

[illegible]